### Digital Health Study Physicians' motivations and requirements for adopting digital clinical tools





# Introduction: Digital Health Tools



What **attracts** 

What are their requirements for adoption?

**Digital Health Study** © 2016 American Medical Association. All rights reserved.



# Key findings

# 1 Where is the digital divide?

Most US physicians are using a few digital tools today and expect to use more in the near future. Heavier users tend to be **PCPs** and physicians in **large and complex practices**. Age is less of a factor than practice size and setting.

# 3

# What do physicians require for adoption?

Physicians require digital tools to fit within their **existing systems** and practices

- Coverage for liability
- Data privacy is assured by experts
- Linked to EMR
- Billing/reimbursement

# 2 What's the appeal of digital tools?

Physicians want digital healthcare tools to **do what they do better** 

- Improve practice efficiency
- Increase patient safety
- Improve diagnostic ability
- Reduce burnout
- Improve physician patient relationship

# How do they want to be involved?

Whether employees or owners physicians want to be **part of the decision making** but they look to others as well

- IT experts for technical issues such as data safety
- Practice leaders for buying decisions



# 2 Study background

### Digital Health Tools: What attracts physicians? What are their requirements for adoption?

#### Objective

Interest in digital healthcare tools is high among developers, regulators, insurers as well as some patients and physicians. However, given the challenges of implementing electronic patient records there is a need for rigorous understanding of physicians' motivations and their requirements for successful integrating these technologies into their practices.

#### Action

The AMA will use this study as it develops principles and best practices to

- Support its advocacy on behalf of physicians
- Affect the trajectory of the digital health marketplace
- Connect the voice of the physician to new technologies being developed



## Study methodology



- The AMA contracted with TNS, the largest custom research company, to study US physicians' enthusiasm, needs and requirements for digital tools in general and seven tools in particular
- The study and analysis was conducted under the direction of Lynne Thomson, PhD
- Working in concert with the AMA TNS developed and administered a 15 minute online survey



 Provide a minimum of 20 hours of direct patient care each week



- Stakeholder review and market scan completed
- Literature review
- Eight thought-leader interviews
- Qualitative pre test of questionnaire
- Quantitative fieldwork conducted July 7-18, 2016

Final sample, physician Segments & Sub-groups										
Total Physicians	PCPs	Specialists	Age <40	Age 41-50	Age 51+	Solo Practice	Group Practice	Other Practice	AMA Members	Non- Members
N=1300	N=650	N=650	N=289	N=449	N=562	N=196	N=879	N=225	N=359	N=941

#### Digital Health Study





## Survey instrument

#### Definitions

**Digital healthcare:** Digital health encompasses a broad scope of tools that engage patients for clinical purposes; collect, organize, interpret and use clinical data; and manage outcomes and other measures of care quality. This includes, but is not limited to, digital solutions involving telemedicine and telehealth, mobile health (mHealth), wearables (e.g., Fitbit), remote monitoring, apps, and others.

	Remote monitoring for efficiency	Remote monitoring and management for improved care	Clinical decision support	Patient engagement
Specific tools	Tele-visits/ virtual visits	Point of care/ workflow enhancement	Consumer access to clinical data	

**EHR app store:** Imagine that you could improve or extend the features in your EHR by purchasing apps from an app store that would securely integrate into the EHR workflow. This would be a special app store just for clinicians, not an existing store (i.e., Google Play, iTunes). The apps would add capabilities like improved data visualization, decision support, improved documentation in the patient record and integration with other tools and services.

#### **Questions** Overall Involvement in Digital Health

- Impact of on ability to provide care
- Overall motivators/attractants
- Overall functional requirements

#### Specific digital tools

- Familiarity
- Current use
- Relevance for practice
- Enthusiasm
- Timeline for incorporating into practice
- Ideal level of involvement in Digital Health, in general

#### Individual tool deep dives

(Ask for up to two relevant solutions, not currently being used)

- Overall motivators/attractants towards solution
- Rank of top 3 motivators/attractants
- Overall functional requirements of solution adoption
- Rank of top 3 functional requirements
- Level of disruption caused by solution
- Ideal level of involvement with decision to incorporate solutions

#### EHR app store evaluation

- Current use of EHR
- Interest in purchasing from app store (definition above)
- Decision maker for app store purchases
- Importance of app selection criteria

#### **Physician profile**

- Age, gender, state, specialty, practice type, practice ownership, years in practice, hours of patient care, professional organization membership)
- Enthusiasm for tech in professional setting
- Influence on tech decision making



Digital Health Study

## Foundation concepts to understand tech adoption

#### Disruptive innovation

Disruptions that overturn markets are a hot topic across business and technology; however, rigorous study of tech adoption shows that **fitting into** current goals and processes is critical to adoption.

New technologies are adopted rapidly – or at all – to the extent that they

- Solve a problem users readily recognize
- Fit within existing physical environments and processes
- Leverage analogs to telegraph what it does and how I work it

Once a new technology is firmly in place it can facilitate disruption, but the promise of disruption is unlikely to lead to adoption.

Innovation and Diffusion by Bronwyn H Hal, National Bureau of Economic Research, Working Paper 10212

#### Crossing the chasm



Tech adoption tends to follow a normal curve. Many innovations start strong but stall at 15% penetration; they never cross to the mainstream market.

Innovations with penetration > 15% have significant potential to become mainstream. Those  $\leq$ 15% are still works in progress.

Crossing the Chasm, Geoffrey Moore, 1991



# 3 Physicians' perceptions of digital health

- What's attractive about them
- What do physicians require for adoption
- How do they want to be involved in decisions on adoption and deployment



Most physicians see potential for digital tools to improve patient care

#### "How much of an advantage do digital health solutions give to your ability to care for your patients?"



Q16. Considering the overall impact, how much of an advantage do digital health solutions give to your ability to care for your patients?.

Base: Total Physicians (n=1300), PCPs (n=650), Specialists (n=650), Age <40 (n=289), Age 41-50 (n=449), Age 51+ (n=562), Solo Practice (n=196), Group Practice (n=879), Other Practice (n=225), AMA Member (n=359), Non-Member (n=941) \*Statistically significantly difference at 95% confidence interval



Digital Health Study



# Physicians are attracted to digital health tools they believe will improve current practices

Younger and female physicians are also optimistic digital tools will improve practice for physicians and patients

Improves work efficiency	48	_	34		The broad appeal of digital tools is improving efficiency, patient safety	
Increases patient safety	47		33			
Improves diagnostic ability	41		38		and diagnostic ability	
Helps to reduce stress and burn-out	39		27		Younger and female	
Improves the patient-physician relationship	38		35		physicians also look to tools to help reduce burn-	
Increases patient adherence	36		39		out, improve the patient-	
Increases patient convenience	32		45		physician relationship and increased adherence and	
Improves resource allocation for staff	28	40			convenience for patients	
Allows me to see more patients	27	32				
Allows me to provide care to my patients remotely	26	34				
Provides a new stream of revenue					Physicians are less interested in doing	
Demonstrates awareness of the latest technologies	22	38			something different –	
Differentiates my practice from others	21	31			seeing more patients or uncovering a new	
Patients demand it	13 3	30			revenue stream	

#### What Attracts Physicians to Digital Health Tools?

Q17. When thinking about incorporating digital health solutions into your practice, how important would each factor be? Base: Total Physicians (n=1300)

#### Digital Health Study

© 2016 American Medical Association. All rights reserved.

<u>5 – Very Important</u> 4

3, 2, 1- Not Important



Physicians need tools to fit within current systems Look to tech experts to insure privacy, security

#### What Requirements Must be Met by Digital Health Tools?

Is covered by my standard malpractice insurance	52	29	Malpractice coverage,		
Data privacy/security is assured by my EHR vendor	50	32	data privacy and workflow integration		
Is well integrated with my EHR	48	33	are essential		
Data privacy is assured by my own practice/hospital	47	34			
Can be reimbursed for time spent using it	43	32	Physicians should be able to be reimbursed		
It is supported by my EHR vendor	40	36	for time spent		
Is proven to be as good or superior to traditional care	40	37	Tools should be easy to		
Intuitive; requires no special training	36	38	use and as effective as current methods of care.		
It is the standard of care	33	39			
Its safety and efficacy is validated by the FDA	33	36			
Its safety and efficacy have been demonstrated in peer reviewed publications	32	39			
The leaders within my practice/area of specialty recommend it	18	37			
Other physicians I know are using it	14 30				

Q18. How important are each of the attributes below in facilitating the adoption of digital health solutions into your practice? Base: Total Physicians (n=1300)

#### Digital Health Study

© 2016 American Medical Association. All rights reserved.

5 – Very Important

3, 2, 1- Not Important





"How involved would you want to be in the adoption of digital health solutions into your practice?"



Q40. Ideally, how involved would you want to be in the adoption of digital health solutions into your practice?

Base: Total Physicians (n=1300), PCPs (n=650), Specialists (n=650), Solo owner (n=329), Part owner (n=319), Employee (n=652)

\*Statistically significantly difference at 95% confidence interval

#### Digital Health Study

AMARICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION

### Physicians want extended capabilities in their EHRs but look to practice leaders to make buying decisions

Apps that extend your EHR system's capabilities and are securely integrated into the EHR workflow Likelihood for practice to buy?



#### Who will make the buying decision?



Q33. How likely are you or your practice to purchase apps that extend your EHR system's capabilities and are securely integrated into the EHR workflow? Q34. If there were an app store for your EHR system...?

Base: Use EHR: Total Physicians (n=1192), PCPs (n=601), Specialists (n=591), Solo owner (n=329), Part owner (n=319), Employee (n=652)

\*Statistically significantly difference at 95% confidence interval

#### Digital Health Study



# **4** Physicians' perceptions of seven digital health tools

Current use and enthusiasm for specific tools

- Profile of digital users
- Plans for adoption for tools not yet utilized



### Nearly half of all physicians are enthusiastic about new digital solutions



Q20. Which, if any, of these do you currently incorporate into your practice? Q22. Which, if any, of the solutions below are you enthusiastic about? Base: Total Physicians (n=1300)

\*Descriptions of digital solutions can be found on Slide 9

#### Digital Health Study

 $\ensuremath{\mathbb{C}}$  2016 American Medical Association. All rights reserved.



## Digitals tools are used by all types of physicians

Younger physicians are slightly more likely to use more digital tools. Tenure is a small predictor of use but not enthusiasm.

PCPs and those in larger, more complex practice settings use and want to use slightly more digital tools



Q20. Which, if any, of these do you currently incorporate into your practice? Q22. Which, if any, of the solutions below are you enthusiastic about? Base: Total Physicians (n=1300)

\*Hospital includes Ambulatory Surgery Centers and Urgent Care





### Physicians anticipate rapid adoption, minimal disruption from digital tools

	١	Norks in Progre Early Adopter	-	Established Solutions/ Early Majority		Mainstream Innovation/ Late Majority	
	Tele-visits / virtual visits	Remote monitoring for efficiency	Remote monitoring for ( improved care	Clinical decision support	Patient Engagement	Point of care / workflow enhancement	Consumer access to clinical data
Beyond a Year Within the Year Already Using	11 14 14	15 20 12	15 20 13	9 17 28	10 20 26	7 14 42	4 <sub>8</sub> 53
Not using, not enthusiastic	61	53	53	46	44	37	36
to use Among those not y	yet using but cl	assifying the too	l as relevant to tl	heir practices			
Some disruption, not discouraging	50	38	51	52	53	53	50
No disruption	29 21	54	34 15	34 14	31 16	35 12	35 15

Q23. When would you expect to start incorporating this solution into your own practice?

Base: Total Physicians,

Substantial disruption

Q30. This digital health solution would...?

Early Majority 34%

Base: Total Physicians, **Evaluated Solution**: Each solution (n=351)

#### Digital Health Study



Elements that attract physicians to digital health overall are consistent across all tools



#### Digital Health Study

# Likewise, there is consistency in what would be required to adopt specific digital health tools



#### Digital Health Study



# Thank you

**Digital Health Study** © 2016 American Medical Association. All rights reserved.



# 5 Appendix

## Key definitions in the study

#### Digital tools in general

Digital health encompasses a broad scope of tools that engage patients for clinical purposes; collect, organize, interpret and use clinical data; and manage outcomes and other measures of care quality. This includes, but is not limited to, digital solutions involving telemedicine and telehealth, mobile health (mHealth), wearables (e.g., Fitbit), remote monitoring, apps, and others.

#### Seven specific tools

Remote monitoring for efficiency	Smart versions of common clinical devices such as thermometers, blood pressure cuffs, and scales that automatically record readings in the patient record so you do not have to type it					
Remote monitoring and management for improved care	Apps and devices for use by chronic disease patients for daily measurement of vital signs such as weight, blood pressure, blood glucose, etc. Readings are visible to patients and transmitted to the physician's office. Alerts are generated as appropriate for missing or out of range readings					
Clinical decision support	Clinical decision support - Modules used in conjunction with the EHR or apps that integrate with the EHR that highlight potentially significant changes in patient data (e.g., gain or loss of weight, change in blood chemistry)					
Patient engagement	Solutions to promote patient wellness and active participation in their care for chronic diseases (e.g., adherence to treatment regimens)					
Tele-visits/ virtual visits	An audio/video connection used to see patients remotely (i.e., simple acute illness, adjusting therapy, etc.)					
Point of care/ workflow enhancement	Communication and sharing of electronic clinical data to consult with specialists, make referrals and/or transitions of care					
Consumer access to clinical data	Secure access allowing patients to view clinical information such as routine lab results, receive appointment reminders and treatment prompts, and to ask for prescription refills, appointments and to speak with their physician					

#### EHR app store

Imagine that you could improve or extend the features in your EHR by purchasing apps from an app store that would securely integrate into the EHR workflow. This would be a special app store just for clinicians, not an existing store (i.e., Google Play, iTunes). The apps would add capabilities like improved data visualization, decision support, improved documentation in the patient record and integration with other tools and services.



### Details by individual tools





### Tele-visits / Virtual Visits

An audio/video connection used to see patients remotely (i.e., simple acute illness, adjusting therapy, etc.)

# This tool has not yet cross the chasm of adoption and enthusiasm is not universal. It could improve work efficiency and patient convenience and safety, but would have to be covered by standard liability systems and also allow for easy reimbursement



#### Digital Health Study

AMARICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION

## Remote Monitoring for Efficiency

Smart versions of common clinical devices such as thermometers, blood pressure cuffs, and scales that automatically record readings in the patient record so you do not have to type it

# This tool has not yet cross the chasm of adoption but there is some enthusiasm, driven by PCPs. It would need to be proven to improve efficiency and diagnostic ability while being well integrated into current data systems



#### Digital Health Study



### Remote Monitoring & Management for Improved Care

Apps and devices for use by chronic disease patients for daily measurement of vital signs such as weight, blood pressure, blood glucose, etc. Readings are visible to patients and transmitted to the physician's office. Alerts are generated as appropriate for missing or out of range readings

# This tool has not yet cross the chasm of adoption but there is some enthusiasm, driven by PCPs. Improved safety and adherence would motivate use, as long as it was easy to adopt and well integrated with current systems



#### **Evaluation among Total Physicians**

Digital Health Study



Drivers among Physicians where

## **Clinical Decision Support**

Modules used in conjunction with the EHR or apps that integrate with the EHR that highlight potentially significant changes in patient data (e.g., gain or loss of weight, change in blood chemistry)

# This tool is in the early stages of adoption and physicians are moderately enthusiastic. Attractive because it could increase patient safety and improve physicians' current ways of working, the tool would have to work well with current data systems and be easy to use



#### Digital Health Study

AMARICAN MEDICAL AMERICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION

## Patient Engagement

Solutions to promote patient wellness and active participation in their care for chronic diseases (e.g., adherence to treatment regimens)

This tool is in the early stages of adoption and physicians, particularly PCPs and those in Group practice, show some enthusiasm. Physicians would be motivated to use in order to increase patient safety and adherence as well as to improve current ways of working. The tool would have to work well with current data and liability systems and be easy to use

**Evaluation among Total Physicians** Drivers among Physicians where Tool is Relevant, but Not Yet Used Current State **Most Attractive Elements Technology Adoption Life Cycle** Current Above average importance & ranking 26 Incorporation 1. Increases patient adherence Enthusiasm 49 2. Increases patient safety Chasn Relevance (T2B) 70 3. Improves work efficiency 2.5% Familiarity (T2B) 68 4. Improves patient-doc relationship Early Adopter Early Majority Late Majority Laggards 13.5% Improves diagnostic ability 5. Base: Total Physicians (n=1300) 6. Increases patient convenience Enthusiasm **Kev Functional Requirements** Above average importance & ranking 53 B 51 C 52 49 50 F 48 47 44 42 1. Well integrated with EHR 2. Covered by standard malpractice Special-Other Non-Requires no special training PCPs <40 41-50 51 +Type Member Member ists Solo Group (B) (C) (D) (H) (A) (E) (F) (G) (I) (J) 4. As good as traditional care AMA Specialty Physician Age Practice Type 5. Can be reimbursed for time spent Membership Base: PCP (n=650), Specialist (n=650), Age <40 (n=289), Age 41-50 (n=449), Age 51+ (n=562), Solo Practice (n=196), Disruption Group Practice (n=879), Other Practice (n=225) Timeline of Adoption 5 53 Great deal of disruption, would consider not using 39 6 12 23 19 Great deal of disruption, but benefits outweigh inconvenience Some disruption, but not discouraging Next Some other Alreadv Immediately Next Next year No disruption using 6 months 2-3 years time Base: Evaluated Solution: Total Physicians (n=351)

Base: Total Physicians, Excited About Solution: Patient Engagement (n=632)

Digital Health Study © 2016 American Medical Association. All rights reserved.



### Consumer Access to Clinical Data

Secure access allowing patients to view clinical information such as routine lab results, receive appointment reminders and treatment prompts, and to ask for prescription refills, appointments and to speak with their physician

This tool has already moved into the later stages of adoption. Enthusiasm may be waning. Increases in patient safety and convenience, along with a more efficient workflow, attract physicians to this tool. Assurances of data security and liability coverage are necessary in order to encourage continued use



#### Digital Health Study



# Point-of-care / Workflow Enhancement

Communication and sharing of electronic clinical data to consult with specialists, make referrals and/or transitions of care

This tool has already moved into the later stages of adoption and enthusiasm remains high, particularly among PCPs. Attractive because it could increase patient safety and improve physicians' current ways of working, the tool must work well with current data and liability systems in order to encourage continued use



#### **Evaluation among Total Physicians**

Digital Health Study

